

A Survey of the “interrogation marks” in the Major Manuscripts of Platonic Alcibiades I

Akitsugu Taki

1. Introduction

The comma-shaped mark mostly placed in the space under the two-dot speaker-changing mark in Plato’s medieval manuscripts was newly invented in the 9th century. It is not attributed to Plato, who probably had no punctuation. Nor does it provide editors of the text with any evidence for the tradition of the text. Unlike common errors in manuscripts, it is not inherent in the original text.

However, as my previous surveys of this medieval punctuation practice in part of Plato’s major manuscripts¹ show, the sentence with the mark under discussion at its end very often points to the speaker’s intention of asking a question. Certainly, few of the sentences beginning with interrogative pronouns have the mark at their ends; nor is the mark placed consistently at the sentence-ends with the same grammatical features such as the particle ΟΥΚΟΥ even in the same question-and-answer session. Therefore, by comparison with the consistency in punctuation in the publications in modern European languages, the marks cannot be called “interrogation marks”. However, under closer examination, the marked sentences are characterised not only by interrogative particles such as ὅρα and ἦ but also by colloquially interrogative features such as negatives for denying the interlocutor’s possible ideas, particles for referring to the interlocutor’s previous response or possible ideas, and adverbs and parenthetical opinion verbs for weakening assertiveness. Hence, the mark under discussion, although irrelevant to the reconstruction of Plato’s original text, suggests how medieval scholars understood Socratic questions in Plato’s dialogues and how Plato could have represented them in a language with no interrogative word-order and in the age of no punctuation.

¹ A. Taki “A Survey on the Interrogation Marks in Plato’s Byzantine Manuscript, Parisinus graecus 1807, fol. 1^r col. 1 – fol. 14^r col. 1” (Text and Title in Japanese) with an English abstract, *Josai International University Bulletin*, Faculty of Humanities, 16-2 (2008) 73-104; id. “A Survey of the “interrogation marks” in Plato’s Socratic Dialogues (the *Gorgias*, *Meno*, *Hippias Major*, *Hippias Minor*, *Ion*, *Republic I*) in Vindobonensis suppl. gr. 39 (Codex F) in Comparison with Those in His Other Major Manuscripts” *Material Culture Studies*, Josai International University, 6 (2009) 1-21.

In what follows, in order to reinforce this hypothesis, I shall proffer, as in my previous works, a graphical and grammatical survey of the mark under discussion in the main medieval manuscripts of Platonic *Alcibiades I*, a dialogue rich in questions, explicit or inexplicit, with some additional comments on the results.

2. A list of “interrogation marks” in the *Alcibiades I*

In the list below, as in the previous work in this bulletin, I record the mark in question by the preceding word and its reference, and I add selected grammatical characteristics in the clause and also in the context. The reference begins each entry, followed by (1) abbreviations for the grammatical characteristics in round brackets, (2) the corresponding description of the clause and context in Greek, (3) the codices in which the mark appears, and (4) the graphical characteristics of the mark there. Different readings in the manuscripts are, if necessary, recorded after each Codex register in round brackets.

Sigla

Codices: **B**: Bodleianus E.D. Clarke 39 (895 AD); **T**: Venetus Marcianus gr. append. Class. IV 1 (mid-10th century); **P**: Vaticanus Palatinus gr. 173 (10th-11th century); **W**: Vindobonensis suppl. gr. 7 (11th century); **D**: Venetus 185 (12th century); **Δ**: Vaticanus gr. 225 (13th century?); **M**: Cesena, Bibliotheca Malatestiana D XXVIII, 4 (14th century?).

Reference is made according to the pagination and section in Stephanus' edition (1578) and to the line in Burnet's edition (*Platonis Opera*, t 2, Oxford, 1901).

Abbreviations for the grammatical characteristics of the sentence with the mark under discussion and of its context: **I**: interrogatives, i.e., interrogative pronoun, adverb, etc; **IP**: interrogative particles such as ἄρα, ἦ, and μῶν; **CP**: continuative particles such as καί, δέ, ἀλλά, and οὖν, which mostly refer to the previous question or response; **1P**: the finite verb in the first person singular: some explicit or implicit mark for the speaker's intention; **2P**: the finite verb in the second person or any other sign mentioning the respondent's intention; **1PP**: the finite verb in the first person plural: some explicit or implicit mark for the speaker and respondent's intention; **Rq**: request for response, such as τι δέ, εἰπέ μοι, πῶς λέγεις etc; **el**: ellipsis: an elliptical form of the previous question or response; **oq**: οὐκοῦν; **ara**: ἄρα; **adv kai**: adverbial καί; **gar**: γάρ; **h.e.**: ὡς ἔοικεν; **ind. q.**: indirect question; **oimai**: parenthetical οἶμαι; **pou**: indefinite adverb που; **depou**: δήπου; **isos**: ἴσως; **0**: grammatically unmarked.

An asterisk“ * ” against a reference indicates that Burnet does not place an interrogation mark at the last word of the sequence I cite.

Abbreviations for the graphical characteristics of the mark under discussion in Codices: the figure 3 in small character at the right foot of a Codex register means “a three-stroke mark”, *i.e.*, a two-dot speaker-changing mark and a twist below it; the figure 2 likewise “a two-stroke mark”, *i.e.*, a single dot and a twist below it but “3dots” simply “three vertical dots); “l”, “m” or “r” following the figures 2 or 3 each means where the twist is placed below the two-dot or one-dot component: “l” means “on the left-hand side, “m” “in the middle” and “r” “on the right-hand side”. “mrg” in small character at the right shoulder of a Codex register means “*in margine*” and the bracket { } encircling a Codex register means *ut videtur*.

106a8 (2P) ἔχεις λέγειν P_{3m}W_{3l}D_{3l}M_{3m}; 106b7 (IP)(2P) ἦ ... δοκεῖ ... ἐρωτώμενα P_{3l}
 abreast W_{3m}M_{2m}; 106d2* (ara)(2P) περὶ ὧν ἄρ' ... εἶ W_{3r}M_{2m}; 106d8 (CP)(2P)
 ἔστιν οὖν ... ἔμαθες ... ζητεῖν T_{3m}P_{3m}W_{3m}M_{2m}; 106d11 (Rq)(2P)
 τί δέ ἠθελήσασ ... ὥλου T_{3m}P_{3r}W_{3l}M_{2m}; 106e2 (ara)(2P) ἃ ἄρα ... εἰδέναι M_{2m}; 107a3
 (I) πότερον ... συμβουλευσων T_{3m}P_{3l}W_{3m}M_{2m}; 107a5 (CP)(el)
 ἀλλ' ... λύραι T_{3m}D_{3l}M_{2m}; 107a8* (CP) οὐδὲ μὴν ... ἐκκλησίαι W_{3l}; 107a11*
 (N)(gar)(pou) οὐ γάρ που ... οἰκοδομίασ W_{3m}D_{3l}; 107a13* (gar)(2P)
 οἰκοδόμος γάρ ... σοῦ ... συμβουλεύσει D_{3l}M_{2m}; 107b2 (CP)(el)
 οὐδὲ ... βουλευώνται D_{3l}; 107b4* (gar)(2P) μάντισ γάρ ... ἦ σύ D_{3l}; 107b10*
 (gar)(oimai) εἰδότος γάρ οἶμαι ... πλουτοῦντος D_{3l} infra sigma; 107c8 (2P)
 τῶν περὶ ναυπηγίας λέγεις ... ναυπηγεῖσθαι B_{3m}T_{3r}P_{3r}W_{3m}D_{3l}M_{2m}; 107c11
 (disjunctive cnj)(tautology) τοῦτ' ... ἢ ἄλλο τι D_{3l}; 107d6 (IP)(2P)
 ἄρα λέγεις ... τρόπον B_{3m}P_{3l}Δ_{3r}M_{2m}; 107d8 (CP)(N)
 χρῆ δ' οὐχ οἷς βέλτιον T_{3r}P_{3m}W_{3l}D_{3l}M_{2m}; 107e1 (CP)(el)
 καὶ ... βέλτιον B_{3m}T_{3r}P_{3m}W_{3m}M_{2m}; 107e3 (CP)(el) καὶ ... ἀμείνον T_{3r}P_{3m}W_{3l}D_{3l}Δ_{3m}M_{2m};
 108a1 (IP)(adv kai)(el) ἄρα καὶ ... ἄμεινον T_{3m}P_{3m}W_{3m}D_{3l}M_{2m}; 108a3 (oq)(adv kai)
 οὐκοῦν καὶ τότε ... ἀμείνον B_{3m}T_{3m}P_{3m}D_{3l}Δ_{3r}M_{2m}; 108a6 (CP)(adv kai)
 ἀλλὰ μὴν καὶ αἰδοντα ... βαίνειν B_{3m}P_{3m}D_{3l}; 108a8 (oq)(el)
 οὐκοῦν ... βέλτιον B_{3m}T_{3r}P_{3m}W_{3l}D_{3l}M_{2m}; 108a10 (CP)(el)
 καὶ ... βέλτιον B_{3m}T_{3m}P_{3m}W_{3m}D_{3l}M_{2m}; 108b7 (disjunctive cnj)(N)(tautology)
 ἐγὼ γάρ ...γιγνόμενον ἢ οὐ D_{3l}; 108b9 (CP)(N) ἢ δὲ ... οὐ ... ἦν T_{3r}P_{3m}W_{3l}D_{3l}Δ_{3r}M_{2m};

108c4	(oq)	οὐκοῦν καλῶς B _{3m} Δ _{3m} ;	108c9	(N)
οὐπω δύνασαι εἶπειν B _{3m} T _{3r} P _{3m} W _{3m} Δ _{3r} M _{2m} ;			108c12	(2P)
τάσ ... λέγεις {B _{3m} P _{3m} D _{3l} Δ _{3r} M _{2m} ;	109a3	mid-speech		(CP)(N)(2P)
περὶ δὲ ... οὐκ αἰσχύνη P _{2m} ;	109a3	(N)(2P)	ἢ οὐκ αἰσχρὸν φανεῖται T _{3r} W _{3l} M _{2m} ;	
109a10* mid-speech (2P)(N) οὐδ' οἶσθα ... πολεμεῖν T _{2r} W _{2m} M _{2m} ;	109a11	(2P)(N)(CP)		
οὐδ' οἶσθα ... καὶ ὅτι ... ἐρχόμεθα T _{3m} P _{3r} W _{3l} M _{2m} ;	109c7	(IP)(adv kai)		(2P)
Πρὸς ταῦτ' ἄρα καὶ σὺ ... ποιήσει B _{3m} Δ _{3m} ;	109e2			(Rq)(N)(2P)
τί δ' ... οὐκ ἂν οἶει ... ἀδίκων B _{3r} P _{3m} Δ _{3m} M _{2m} ;	109e4			(CP)(N)(2P)
ἀλλ' οὐκ ... ἡγεῖ B _{3m} P _{3l} Δ _{3m} M _{2m}	(ἡγῆ	PM);	109e6	(N)(2P)
εἶτα ... οὐκ ἂν οἶει με B _{3m} P _{3r} W _{3l} Δ _{3r} M _{2m} ;			109e8	(N)
εἶτ' οὐκ ... οὕτω B _{3m} T _{3r} P _{3l} W _{3l} Δ _{3m} M _{2m} ;	110a1	mid-speech		(2P)
ἔχεις οὖν εἶπειν ... ἀδίκα T _{2r} P _{2m} M _{2m} ;			110a6	(N)
τρίτον ... οὐχ οὕτως B _{3m} T _{3r} P _{3l} W _{3l} Δ _{3r} M _{2r} ;	110a8	(IP)	ἢ γάρ T _{3m} P _{3r} W _{3m} M _{2m} ;	110b6
(IP)(N)	ἢ οὐκ ἀληθῆ λέγω T _{3m} W _{3m} M _{2m} ;		110b10	(2P)(IP)
σὺ δὲ ... λέγεις ... ποιεῖν P _{3l} ;	110e4	(Rq)(N)	τί δὲ οὐχ ἵκανοὶ ... οὔτοι W _{3l} P _{3r} ;	110e7
(Rq)(N)(2P)	τί δὲ σὺ οὐχ οὕτως οἶει T _{3r} P _{3m} W _{3l} M _{2m} ;		110e10	(N)
εἶτα ... οὐχ ... σπουδαιότερα T _{3m} P _{3m} W _{3l} M _{2m} ;			111b4	(oq)(el)
οὐκοῦν ... διαφέρεσθαι P _{3m} ;			111b7	(CP)(2P)
ἐν οἷς δ' ... φήσεις ... αὐτοῦς T _{3l} P _{3m} W _{3l} infra sigma M _{2m} ;	111b12	mid-speech		(Rq)(2P)
τί οὖν δοκοῦσί σοι ... ξύλον P _{2m} W _{2m} ;			111c2	(adv kai)
ὡσαύτως καὶ ... τοιαῦτα T _{3r} P _{3m} W _{2m} (mid-speech W: wrong speech-division TP);	111d9			
(Rq)(mid-clause IP)	τί δ' ... ἄρ' ... διδάξει P _{3m} W _{3m} ;		111e2	(CP)(2P)
ἵκανὸν δε σοί ... αὐτῶν P _{3r} W _{3l} ;	111e6	(Rq)(1PP)(mid-clause IP)		
τί δ' ... ἄρ' ... οἱ πολλοί P _{3m} W _{3l} M _{2m} ;			111e9	(CP)(2P)
ἦν δ' ἂν σοι ... διαφορομένους T _{3r} P _{3l} W _{3l} M _{2m} ;			112a2	(Rq)(2P)
τί δὲ δὴ ... δοκοῦσί σοι ... ἀλλήλοισ P _{3l} W _{3l} ;			112a4	(Rq)
τί δὲ μάλιστα ... διαφέρεσθαι P _{3m} W _{3l} M _{2m} ;			112b5	(oq)
οὐκοῦν ... ἀδίκων T _{3r} P _{3m} W(3l) M _{2m} ;	112c6	(IP e)	ἢ γάρ P _{3m} D _{3m} M _{2m} ;	112d2
(oun)(1PP)	τούτους οὖν φῶμεν ... ἐργάζονται T _{3r} P _{3m} W _{3m} M _{2m} ;		112d5	(oq)(2P)
οὐκοῦν ... ἀναφέρεις ... εἰδέναι T _{3r} W _{3m} M _{2m} ;	112e1	(2P)	ὄραϊς ... Ἀλκιβίαδη M _{2m} ;	
112e5	(Rq)(N)(2P)	τί δὲ σὺ σὺ λέγεις ... ἀδίκων W _{3l} P _{3m} M _{2m} ;	112e7	(CP)
ἀλλ' ἐγὼ T _{2m} P _{3m} W _{3l} M _{2m} ;	112e11	(2P)	ἐὰν ... δύο B _{3m} T _{3r} P _{3m} Δ _{3r} M _{2m} ;	112e18
οὐκοῦν ... σὺ δ' ἀπεκρίνου B _{3m} D _{3l} Δ _{3m} M _{2m} (ἀποκρίνου Δ);			113b1	(oq)

ούκουν ... ἐρωτῶν $T_{3r}W_{3l}M_{2m}$; 113b3 (2P)(el) σὺ δ' ὁ ἀποκρινόμενος $P_{3r}M_{2m}$ (113b2
 ναί om. P); 113b11 (N) οὐ ταῦτ' ἦν $P_{3m}D_{3l}M_{2m}$; 114b7 (IP e) ἡ γὰρ $P_{3m}M_{2m}$; 114c5
 (IP)(CP)(N) ἄρ' οὖν οὐ ... πείσει $B_{3m}P_{3r}\Delta_{3m}M_{2m}$; 114c7 (CP)
 οὗτος δ' ... ἀριθμητικὸς M_{2m} ; 114c10 (oq)(adv kai)(2P)
 ούκουν καὶ σὺ ... ἕνα $D_{3l}M_{2m}$; 114c12 (CP)(2P)(el)
 ἔστι δὲ ταῦτα δῆλον ὅτι ἂ οἴσθα $T_{3r}P_{3l}W_{3l}M_{2m}$; 114e2 (Rq)(N)
 τί δ' οὐχ ὅτι ... πεισθῆναι $T_{3m}P_{3l}W_{3l}\Delta_{3l}M_{2m}$; 114e5 (oq)(2P)
 ούκουν εἰ λέγεις ... ἂν εἶησ πεπεισμένος $P_{3m}M_{2m}$; 114e9 (Rq)(2P)(N)
 ἀποκρίνου δὴ ... μὴ πιστεύσης W_{3l} ; 115a2 (Rq)(2P)
 καὶ μοι λέγε. τῶν δικαίων φῆισ ... οὐ $B_{3m}P_{3m}\Delta_{3m}M_{2m}$; 115a4 (Rq)(el)
 Τί δέ τὰ μεῖν ... οὐ $B_{3m}P_{3m}W_{3l}\Delta_{3m}M_{2m}$; 115a7 (ind. q.)(2P)
 εἰ ... σοι ἔδοξεν ... πράττειν P_{3l} ; 115a9 (CP) ἀλλὰ ... καλὰ $P_{3m}W_{3m}D_{3l}M_{2m}$; 115a15
 (IP)(adv kai) ἡ καὶ αἰσχροὶ ἀγαθὰ $T_{3r}P_{3m}W_{3l}D_{3m}M_{2m}$; 115b3 (IP)(2P)
 ἄρα λέγεις ... ἀπῆλθον $P_{3m}W_{3m}$; 115b9 (IP)(gar) ἡ γὰρ $P_{3m}W_{3l}M_{2m}$; 115c1 (IP)(CP)(N)
 ἄρ' οὖν οὐκ ... θάνατος $T_{3m}P_{3l}W_{3l}M_{2m}$; 115d3 (oq)(CP)(2P)
 ούκουν ... καὶ ... δέξαιο ἂν στέρεσθαι P_{3m} ; 115d8* (ara)(2P)
 ἔσχατον ἄρα ... σοι δοκεῖ ἡ δειλία $P_{3m}M_{2m}$; 115d13 (oq)
 ούκουν ... ἀνδρεία $P_{3m}M_{2m}$ (ἀνδρία M); 115e2 (CP)(2P)
 και ... βούλοιο σοι ... ἥκιστα $P_{3m}M_{2m}$; 115e4 (IP) ἄρ' ... κάκιστα $B_{2m}P_{3m}W_{3l}M_{2m}$;
 115e13 (CP)(el) κατὰ δέ γε ... κακόν $P_{3m}M_{2m}$; 116a4 (IP)(CP) ἄρ' οὖν ... αἰσchrόν
 $P_{3m}W_{3m}M_{2m}$; 116b3 (Rq)(N) ... ὦδε σκέψαι ... οὐχὶ καὶ εὖ πράττει $P_{3m}W_{3l}M_{2m}$;
 116b5 (CP)(N) οἱ δ' ... οὐκ εὐδαίμονες $P_{3m}W_{3m}M_{2m}$; 116b7 (oq) ούκουν ... κτῆσιν
 $P_{3l}W_{3l}M_{2m}$; 116b9 (CP) κτῶνται δὲ ... πράττειν $P_{3l}W_{3l}M_{2m}$; 116b13 (oq)
 ούκουν ... εὐπραγία $T_{3r}P_{3m}M_{2m}$; 116c2* (ara)(1PP)
 ταῦτὸν ἄρα ἐφάνη ἡμῖν ... ἀγαθόν M_{2m} ; 116c10 (2P)(CP)
 μνημονεύεις οὖν ... ὠμολογήσαμεν $T_{3m}P_{3m}W_{3l}M_{2r}$; 116d1 (CP)
 τὰ δὲ ἀγαθὰ συμφέρειν $T_{3m}P_{3m}M_{2m}$; 116d5 (Rq)
 τί οὖν ταῦτα ... ἐρωτῶν $T_{3m}P_{3m}W_{3l}M_{2m}$; 116e5 (2P) εἶτα ... ἀγνοεῖς ... ἔστιν
 $P_{3l}W_{3m}M_{2m}$ (ἔστι M); 117a3 (oq)(2P) ούκουν οἴσθασ τοῦτ' αἴτιον $T_{3m}M_{2m}$; 117a11 (N)
 εἶτα οὐ δῆλον ... πλαναί $P_{3m}W_{3l}M_{2m}$; 117b3 (IP)(CP) ἄρ' οὖν ... ψυχὴν $P_{3m}M_{2m}$;
 117b5 (Rq)(2P) τί οὖν οἴσθα ... οὐρανόν $P_{3m}M_{2m}$; 117b7 (IP)(2P)
 ἡ ... σου ... ταῦτα $W(, \div)M_{2m}$; 117c4 (2P)(depu) ὥσπερ ... οἴσθα δήπου ... οἴσθα
 $P_{3l}W_{3m}M_{2m}$; 117d9 (2P)(CP) ἐννοεῖς οὖν ... εἰδέναι $B_{3m}P_{3r}\Delta_{3r}M_{2m}$; 117d12 (pou)(1PP)

τότε που επιχειρούμεν ... πράττομεν	$B_{3m}P_{3r}\Delta_{3m}$;	117e2	(CP)
ὅταν δέ γέ ... παραδιδόασι	P_{3m} ;	117e5	(oq) ουκοῦν ... ἐπιτρέπειν M_{2m} ;
(CP)(mid-clause IP)	ἐπειδή δ' ... ἢ ἄλλοι ... εἰδέναι	$W_{3m}M_{2m}$;	118a8 (oq)
οὔκοῦν ... αἰσχίστη	P_{3m} ;	118a11	(Rq)(2P)
τί οὖν ἔχεις ... εἶπειν ... καλῶν καὶ ἀγαθῶν καὶ ξυμφερόντων	$P_{3l}W_{3l}M_{2l}$		
(καλῶν καὶ ξυμφερόντων καὶ ἀγαθῶν P);		118a13	(oq)(2P)
οὔκοῦν ... σὺ φῆις πλανᾶσθαι	$P_{3r}W_{3l}M_{2m}$;	118b2	(CP)(2P)(mid-clause IP)(N)
εἰ δὲ πλανᾷ ἄρ' οὐ ... εἰδέναι	$P_{3m}W_{3l}M_{2m}^{mrg}$;	118c8	mid-speech (Rq)(2P)
τί οὖν ... εἶδες ... ἄπερ αὐτόσ	W_{2l} ;	118c10	(IP)(gar) ἦ γάρ $P_{3m}W_{3m}M_{2m}$;
(oq)(adv kai)(2P)	οὔκοῦν καὶ σὺ ... ἔση	$P_{3m}M_{2m}$;	118d4 (CP)(el)
καὶ ὁ κιθαριστῆς δὲ ... ὠσαύτως	$P_{3m}M_{2m}$;	118d11	(Rq)(2P)
τί οὖν ἔχεις εἶπειν ... ἀρξάμενος	$T_{3l}P_{3m}W_{3m}M_{2m}$;	118e3*	(CP)(2P)
ἀλλὰ ... τὸν σὸν ἀδέλφον	$P_{3m}M_{2m}$;	119d2*	(0) ἄξιον ... μεγαλόφρονα εἶναι $P_{3m}W_{3l}$;
119d3 (N)	οὐ πρὸς ... ὁ ἀγών	$P_{3m}W_{3l}M_{2m}$;	119e8* (ara)(2P)
πάνυ σοι ἄρα ... ἐκείνουσ	P_{3l} ;	120a3	(N)(2P) οὐκ οἶσθα ... ἐκάστοτε $P_{3l}M_{2m}$;
(IP)(CP)(2P)	μῶν οὖν οἶει ... σαυτοῦ	$P_{3m}W_{3l}D_{3l}M_{2m}$;	120e4 (oq)
οὔκοῦν ... ἀρετῆν	D_{3l}	120e9*	mid-speech (Rq)(1PP)(N)
σκεψώμεθα δὴ ... οὐκ ἴσμεν ... ἔκγονοι	$W_{2m}M_{2m}$;	120e10	(CP)
τὸ δ' Ἑρακλέουσ ... ἀναφέρεται	W_{3m} ;	124e1	(IP) ἦ γάρ $P_{3r}D_{3l}M_{2m}$;
(mid-speech IP)	ἄρα τὰ ἵππικὰ	$P_{3m}W_{3m}M_{2m}$;	124e11 (CP)(2P)
ἀλλὰ τὰ ναυτικὰ λέγεισ	$T_{3m}P_{3l}W_{3m}M_{2m}$;	125a4	(oq)
οὔκοῦν ... ἀγαθός	$B_{3m}P_{3m}\Delta_{3m}M_{2m}$;	125a6	(CP de)
ὁ δὲ ἄφρων, πονηρός	$B_{3m}T_{3l}P_{3r}W_{3l}M_{2m}$;	125a9	(IP)(CP)
ἄρ' οὖν ... ἐργασίαν	$B_{3m}T_{3l}P_{3r}\Delta_{3m}M_{2m}$;	125a11	(ara)
ἀγαθός ἄρ' εἰσ αὐτά	$B_{3m}T_{3m}W_{3m}M_{2m}$	(ταῦτα TWM);	125a14 (Rq)(N)
τί δ' εἰσ ... σκυτότομος	$B_{3m}T_{3l}P_{3m}W_{3l}\Delta_{3r}M_{2r}$;	125b1	(ara)
κακός ἄρα εἰσ τοῦτο	$B_{3m}T_{3m}P_{3m}W_{3l}\Delta_{3m}M_{2m}$;	125b4*	(ara)
ὁ αὐτός ἄρα ... ἀγαθός	$B_{3m}T_{3l}W_{3l}\Delta_{3m}M_{2r}$;	125b6	(IP)(CP)(2P)
ἦ οὖν λέγεισ ... κακούσ	$T_{3l}P_{3l}W_{3l}M_{2l}$;	125b10	(N)(depou)(el)
οὐ δήπου ἵππων γε	$T_{3l}P_{3m}W_{3l}D_{3l}M_{2m}$;	125b12	(CP)(el)
ἀλλ' ἀνθρώπων	$B_{3m}T_{3l}P_{3m}W_{3l}D_{3l}$	125b14	(IP)(el)
ἄρα καμνόντων	$B_{3m}T_{3l}P_{3m}W_{3l}D_{3l}\Delta_{3r}M_{2m}$;	125b16	(CP)(el)
ἀλλὰ πλεόντων	$B_{3m}T_{3m}P_{3l}W_{3l}D_{3l}\Delta_{3m}M_{2m}$;	125b18	(CP)(el)

ἀλλὰ θεριζόντων $T_{3l}P_{3m}W_{3l}D_{3m}M_{2m}$; 125c1 (CP)(el)(disjunctive cnj)(tautology)
 ἀλλ' οὐδὲν ποιούντων ἢ τι ποιούντων D_{3l} ; 125c5* (oq) Alcibiades' speech
 οὐκοῦν ... πόλεσιν W_{3l} ; 125c7 (oq)(2P) οὐκοῦν ... λέγεις ... χρωμένον $P_{3m}D_{3l}M_{2r}$;
 125c9 (IP)(el) ἄρα ... ἐρέταις $T_{3l}P_{3r}$ abreast $W_{3l}D_{3l}M_{2m}$; 125c11 (gar)
 κυβερνητική γὰρ ... ἀρετή $T_{3m}D_{3l}$; 125d1 (CP)(2P)
 ἀλλ' ... λέγεις ... χορευταῖς $T_{3l}P_{3r}W_{3l}D_{3l}M_{2m}$; 125d3 (gar)
 χοροδιδασκαλική γὰρ ... αὐ $T_{3l}W_{3m}D_{3l}M_{2m}$ (γ' αὐ πάνυ γε om. P); 125d6
 (CP)(mid-clause I)(2P) ἀλλὰ τί ... λέγεις ... ἄρχειν D_{3m} ; 125e5 (Rq)(mid-clause
 I)(2P) τί δέ ... τίνα καλεῖς ἐπιστήμην P_3 dots; 125e7 (Rq)(IP)(2P)
 τί δέ μῶν ... δοκεῖ ... κυβερνητῶν $B_{3m}T_{3l}W_{3l}D_{3l}M_{2m}$ (lacuna P); 125e9 (CP)
 ἀλλ' εὐβουλία $B_{3m}T_{3m}W_{3m}M_{2m}$; 126a1* (el) εἰς γέ ... πλέοντασ $T_{3l}M_{2m}$ (speech
 division: post ἔμοιγε δοκεῖ M); 126a9 (N)(adv kai)(2P)
 οὐ καὶ σὺ οἶει οὕτως $B_{3l}T_{3l}P_{3l}W_{3l}D_{3l}M_{2m}$ (οὕτω TWM); 126c4 (IP)(CP)(2P)
 ἄρ' οὖν ... λέγεις ... διχόνοιαν $T_{3r}M_{2m}$; 126c9 (Rq)(N)(el)
 τί δέ ... οὐ διὰ τὴν αὐτήν $B_{3m}T_{3m}P_{3l}W_{3l}D_{3l}M_{2m}$; 126c11 (oq)(adv kai)(el)
 οὐκοῦν καὶ ... ἕκαστος $B_{3m}T_{3r}P_{3l}W_{3l}D_{2l}M_{2m}$; 126d2 (Rq)(N)(el)
 διὰ τίνα δέ ... οὐ διὰ τὴν μετρητικὴν $T_{3m}P_{3m}W_{3m}M_{2m}$; 126d4 (oq)(el)(adv kai)
 οὐκοῦν καὶ ... πόλεις P_{3l} ; 126d6 (Rq)(N)(el)
 τί δέ περὶ σταθμοῦ οὐχ ὡσαύτως $T_{3l}P_{3m}W_{3l}M_{2m}$; 126d10 (IP)(el)
 καὶ ἄρα ... ἄλλον $T_{3m}W_{3m}M_{2m}$; 126e7 (2P)(CP)
 οἶει ἄν οὖν ... ἐπισταμένη $B_{3m}T_{3m}P_{3m}W_{3l}D_{3m}M_{2m}$ (ἐπισταμενη PAM); 126e9* (gar)
 γυναικεῖον γὰρ ... μάθημα D_{3l} ; 127a2 (Rq) τί δέ γυνή ... μαθοῦσα $T_{3m}P_{3l}W_{3l}M_{2m}$;
 127a4* (2P)(gar)(isos) ἀνδρεῖον γὰρ ... ἴσως αὐ φαίησ ἄν εἶναι $T_{3m}W_{3l}M_{2m}$ (οἰμωι /
 οἰνωι W); 127c3 (Rq) νῦν δέ πῶς αὐ λέγεις ... ἢ ... οἱ δ' οὐ $P_{3m}M_{2m}$; 127c9 (CP)(N)
 τὰ δίκαια οὖν ... οὐκ ἐγγίγνεται ... ἀλλήλους $T(3l)$ $P_{3m}W_{3l}M_{2m}$; 128a3
 (Rq)(mid-speech IP) καὶ πότ' ... ἄρ' ὅταν ... ἑαυτοῦ M_{2m} ; 128a6 (Rq)(IP)
 τί δέ ... ἄρ' ... ποδῶν $T_{3l}P_{3l}W_{3l}M_{2m}$; 128a9 (2P)
 καλεῖς δέ ... οἶον ... φαίησ ἢ δακτύλου P_{3r} ; 128a11 (oq)(adv kai)(el)
 οὐκοῦν καὶ ... τρόπον $P_{3l}M_{2m}$; 128b3 (IP)(CP)(1PP)
 ἄρ' οὖν ... ἐπιμελούμεθα $P_{3l}M_{2m}$; 128b6 (Rq)(2P)
 τί δέ ... ὀρθῶς ... καλεῖς ... πράγματος P_{3m} ; 128b9 (IP)(CP)(2P)
 ἄρ' οὖν ... λέγεις ἐπιμέλειαν $T_{3m}P_{3r}$ abreast $W_{3l}D_{3m}M_{2m}$; 128b13 (ara)
 σκυτικὴ ἄρα ... ἐπιμελούμεθα $B_{3m}T_{3l}W_{3l}D_{3m}M_{2m}$; 128c5 (CP)(N)(el)

βελτίουσ δὲ ... οὐχ ... σῶμα	$B_{3m}T_{3m}P_{3l}W_{3l}\Delta_{3r}M_{2r}$;	128c7	(CP)(N)
αὕτη δ' οὐ γυμναστική	$B_{3m}T_{3r}P_{3m}W_{3m}\Delta_{3m}M_{2m}$;	128c10	(ara)
γυμναστική μὲν ἄρα ... ποδός	$B_{3m}\Delta_{3m}$;	128c13	(CP)
καὶ γυμναστική ... χειρός	$B_{3m}T_{3m}W_{3l}D_{3l}\Delta_{3m}M_{2m}$;	128d1	(CP)(el)
καὶ γυμναστική ... σῶματος	P_{3l} ;	128d9*	(gar)(h.e.)(N)
οὐ γὰρ ... ὡς εοικεν ... αὐτοῦ	{ D_{3l} };	128e5	(IP)(CP)
ἦ οὖν ... ὑπόδημα	$P_{3l}M_{2m}$;		
οὐδέ γε ... δακτύλιον	$T_{3m}W_{3m}$;	128e11	(Rq)(mid-clause IP)(1PP)
τί δὲ ... ἄρ' ... γνοιμεν ... αὐτοί	$T_{3m}P_{3m}M_{2m}$ (illegible W);	129b8	(oq)(adv kai)(2P)
οὐκοῦν καὶ ἐγὼ σοί	P_{3m} ;	129b10	(ara)
Σωκράτης ἄρ' ... διαλεγόμενος	$T_{3l}P_{3r}W_{3l}M_{2m}$;	129b12	(CP)
Ἄλκιβιάδης δ' ὁ ἀκούων	$T_{3l}P_{3l}W_{3l}$ <small>abreast</small> M_{2m} ;	129b14	(oq)
οὐκοῦν ... Σωκράτης	$T_{3l}W_{3l}M_{2m}$;	129c3*	(CP)(2P)(pou)
τὸ δὲ διαλέγεσθαι ... καλεῖσ	$T_{3l}P_{3m}W_{3l}M_{2m}$;	129c5	(CP)(N)
ὁ δὲ χρώμενος ... οὐκ ἄλλο	$T_{3m}P_{3m}W_{3l}M_{2m}$;	129c8*	(pou)
ὥσπερ ... ὀργάνοις	$B_{3m}T_{3l}W_{3l}M_{2m}$;	129c14	(IP)(CP)
ἄρ' οὖν ... εἶη	$B_{3m}T_{3m}P_{3m}\Delta_{3m}$		
(129c10-15 omit W); 129d2* (ind. q.) τοῦτο ... ἠρώτων εἰ ... εἶναι	P_{3m} ;	129d7	(ara)(adv. kai)
χρηῖται ἄρα καὶ ταύταις	$B_{3m}T_{3m}P_{3m}W_{3l}$;	129d9	(IP)(adv kai)
ἦ καὶ ... σκυτοτομεῖ	$P_{3m}M_{2m}$;	129d11	(CP)(1PP)
τὸ δὲ ... ὁμολογοῦμεν	$B_{3m}P_{3r}M_{2m}$;		
129e3 (oq)(adv. kai) οὐκοῦν καὶ πάντι ... ἄνος	$T_{3m}P_{3l}W_{3l}M_{2m}$ (<u>ἄνος</u> : abbrev. of ἄνθρωπος);	129e5	(CP)
ἕτερον δ' ἦν ... χρηῖται	$T_{3m}P_{3m}W_{3m}M_{2m}$;	129e11*	(2P)(CP)
ἔχεις μὲν οὖν ... χρώμενον	M_{2m} ;	130a1	(IP)(CP)
ἦ οὖν ... ψυχῇ	M_{2m} ;	130a3	(oq)
οὐκοῦν ἄρχουσα	$P_{3l}W_{3m} M_{2m}$;	130b2	(IP)(CP)
ἄρ' οὖν ... ἄρχει	$T_{3r}P_{3m}W_{3m}M_{2m}$;		
130b4* (gar)(1PP) ἄρχεσθαι γὰρ αὐτὸ εἶπομεν	$T_{3m}W_{3m}M_{2r}$;	130b9	(CP)(ara)
ἀλλ' ἄρα ... ἀνος	$P_{3l}W_{3l}M_{2m}$ (<u>ἀνοι</u> M);	131e8	(oq)(2P)
οὐκοῦν ἔφησθα ... ἀπέρχομαι	M_{3l} ;	132c10	(Rq)(mid-speech IP)(N)(1PP)
τίν' οὖν ... ἄρα ... οὐ ξύνισμεν	$P_{3l}W_{3l}M_{2m}$;	132d8	(Rq)(IP)(N)
σκοπεῖ καὶ σύ ... ἄρα οὐχί ... ἰδεῖν	$T_{3r}P_{3m}W_{3l}M_{2m}$;	132e5	(oq)(adv kai)
οὐκοῦν καὶ ... τοιούτων	P_{3l} ;	133a3	(2P)(CP)
ἐννενόηκας οὖν ὅτι ... ἐμβλέποντος	$P_{3r}W_{3l}$;	133a11*	(CP)
εἰ δὲ ... οὐκ ... ἑαυτὸν	D_{3l} ;	133c2	(1PP)(CP)
ἔχομεν οὖν εἰπεῖν ... φρονεῖν	$T_{3m}P_{3l}W_{3m}\Delta_{3m}M_{2m}$ (φρονεῖν ἐστίν Δ);	133c19	(CP)(1PP)
τὸ δὲ ... ὁμολογοῦμεν ... εἶναι	$T_{3m}P_{3m}W_{3m}M_{2m}$;	133c23	(IP)(CP)
ἄρ' οὖν ... ἀγαθὰ	$P_{3l}W_{3l}M_{2m}$;	134a4	(CP)(N)

ὁ δὲ ... οὐχ ἁμαρτήσεται	$T_{3m}P_{3m}W_{3m}M_{2m}$;	134a7	(CP)(N)
ἐξαμαρτάνων δὲ οὐ κακῶς ... δημοσίαι	$T_{3l}P_{3m}W_{3l}M_{2m}$;	134a9	(CP)(N)
κακῶς δὲ ... ἄθλιος	$T_{3l}P_{3m}W_{3l}M_{2m}$;	134a11	(Rq)(el)
τί δ' οἷς οὗτος πράττει	$T_{3m}W_{3m}M_{2m}$;	134c3	(CP)
δύναιτο δ' ... ἔχοι	$T_{3m}P_{3m}M_{2m}$;		
135a3 (ara)(N) ἄρ' οὐχ ... σωμα	$T_{3m}P_{3m}W_{3l}M_{2m}$	(abbrev. $\hat{\sigma}$ P);	135a7 (Rq)(2P)
τί δ' ... καθορᾶις ... ξυναύταις	$T_{3l}P_{3m}W_{3l}M_{2m}$	(ξυναυτ̂ P: ξυναυταις W);	135b11
(oq) οὐκοῦν ... κάλλιον	$T_{3m}P_{3m}M_{2m}$;	135b13	(CP)
τὸ δὲ ... πρεπωδέστερον	P_{3m} ;		
135c13* (2P)(CP) οἶσθα οὖν ... ανδρί	$P_{3m}W_{3l}M_{2m}$.		

3. Comments

(1) Grammatical characteristics of the sentences with a comma-shaped mark at their ends

As the list above shows, the grammatical characteristics of the sentences examined reinforce the hypothesis I posed from my previous surveys (see *Introduction*).

(2) The time and hand of placing a comma-shaped mark

Palaeographically, the signs, such as accents and breathings, other than the text are often added to the text by a later hand in many medieval manuscripts. Hence, one may reasonably assume that the comma-shaped mark is added to the text by a later hand. However, some graphical tokens imply that the hand copying the text places a comma-shaped mark immediately after copying either a single-dot semi-colon or a two-dot speaker-changing mark at the sentence-end. This placement without a break leaves the possibility that the copyist copies the mark from the original.

At 118d11 and 129c14 in Codex T, 107e1 in Codex W and 106a8 in Codex M, the two dots of a speaker-changing mark are placed a little higher than on the base line and at 125b1 and 128c7 in Codex P there is almost no space between the two dots of the speaker-changing mark. Therefore, the copyist may intend to make space for a comma-shaped mark and as a result miss the usual form.

At 115e4 in Codex B, 112e7 in Codex T and 126c11 in Codex D, if a comma-shaped mark were added later, the copyist would not wrongly put for the change of speakers a single dot instead of two dots.

In Codex D, the comma-shaped mark at 126c10 is as at 125d1 and 126a9 attached to the ending-stroke of the final letter of the sentence-end word but here the final letter the u-shaped *nu* extends the ending stroke upward, figuring a downward-convex curve. Hence, if the round-headed comma-shape were attached to the ending-stroke of the u-shaped *nu* some time

after the text was copied, the ink of the round-head would not merge upward into the downward-convex curve of the *nu*'s ending stroke. Therefore, the comma-shaped mark is likely to be placed immediately after the *nu*'s ending stroke. The similar phenomenon can be observed at the ending stroke of the *alpha* at 126e9.

(2) The origin of the practice under discussion in the *Alcibiades* I manuscripts

The number of the sentence-ends with a comma-shaped mark in the space under the single-dot colon or two-dot speaker-changing mark is: **B**: 49; **T**: 105; **P**: 169; **W**: 139; **D**: 47; **Δ**: 41; **M**: 177. Also, the number of those in common to given two codices: **BT**: 31; **BP**: 38; **BW**: 31; **BD**: 14; **BA**: 36; **BM**: 42; **TP**: 81; **TW**: 91; **TD**: 23; **TA**: 26; **TM**: 100; **PW**: 110; **PD**: 28; **PA**: 33; **PM**: 139; **WD**: 24; **WA**: 25; **WM**: 121; **DA**: 11; **DM**: 33; **ΔM**: 36. Therefore, in sentence-ends with the mark under discussion, none of the codices is subsumed under any other nor do any two completely agree. In other words, each codex is partly independent in the transmission of this mark, as shown by the following contrasts: sentence-end with this mark (abbreviated “q” below) **B**: sentence-end without it (abbreviated “nq” below) **TPDW** (108c4; 109c7; 128c10); q **TPWD**: nq **B** (107d8; 107e3; 108a1; 108b9; 115a15; 125b10; 125b18; 125c9; 125 d1); q **T**: nq **BPWD** (117a3; 126a1; 126c4); q **BPDT**: nq **T** none; q **P**: nq **BTWD** (110b10; 111b4; 117e2; 118a8; 118d2; 118d4; 118e3; 119e8; 120a3; 125e5; 126d4; 127c3; 128a9; 128a11; 128b3; 128b6; 128d1; 128e5; 129b8; 129d2; 129d9; 132e5; 135b13); q **BTWD**: nq **P** (128c13); q **W**: nq **BTPD** (107a11); q **BTPD**: nq **W** (108a3); q **D**: nq **BTPW** (107a13; 107b2; 107b4; 107b10; 107c11; 108b7; 114c10; 120e4; 125c1; 125d6; 126e9; 128d9; 133a11); q **BTPW**: nq **D** (107e1; 108c9; 109e8; 110a6; 125a6; 125a14; 125b1; 126e7; 128c5; 128c7; 129c14; 129d7).

In the transmission of the mark under discussion, as in the transmission of the text, Codices **B** and **Δ** and Codices **T**, **P**, **W** and **M** each seem to form a group in the number and marked sentence-ends against Codex **D**. This assumption is reinforced by additional contrasts as follows: q **BA**: nq **TPWM** (108c4; 109c7; 128c10); q **TPWM**: nq **BA** (106d8; 106d11; 107a3; 107d8; 108a1; 108b9; 109a11; 110a8; 110e7; 110e10; 111b7; 111e9; 112b5; 112d2; 112e7; 114c12; 115a15; 115c1; 116c10; 116d5; 118d11; 124e11; 125b6; 125b10; 125b18; 125c9; 125d1; 126d2; 126d6; 127a2; 127c9; 128a6; 128b9; 129b10; 129b12; 129c3; 129c5; 129e3; 129e5; 130b2; 132d8; 133c2; 133c19; 134a4; 134a7; 134a9; 135a3; 135a7). However, how the later codices **T**, **P**, **W** and **M** increase the number of marked sentences, whether from their exemplars or some other manuscripts, is hard to determine, because whether or not marked sentence-ends common to any two manuscripts are a token for transmission between

them is not determinable as in the case of common errors in the text of any two manuscripts. However, if some graphical characteristics mentioned above indicate that a number of the marks concerned are transmitted from the original, and if the constancy in mark-placement in the space under the speaker-changing mark, especially the placement on the left-hand side, as in Codices **P** and **W**, peculiar in the left-to-right and up-to-down writing system, is also transmitted from the original, one may hypothesise the possibility that Codices **P**'s and **W**'s increase in marked sentence-ends partly comes from the lost first-volume of Plato's two-volume works in the tradition of Codex **A** (Parisinus gr. 1807), which with Codex **O** (Vaticanus gr. 1) has the left-hand mark-placement unlike Codices **B** and **T**. This possibility may explain why Codex **A** has twice as many marked sentence-ends as Codex **T** in the *Republic*, Book One² and why Codices **T**, **P** and **W** against Codex **B** place the mark concerned at the end of the sentence ἦ γάρ with Codices **A** and **O**.³

² See my previous surveys mentioned in n. 1.

³ *Leges* I-III: 624a5, 626c2, 633d7, 640c2, 646b7, 650b9.